

Economic Survey 2020-21

Volume 1

Government of India
Ministry of Finance
Department of Economic Affairs
Economic Division
North Block
New Delhi-110001
E-mail: cordecdn-dea@nic.in
January, 2021

CONTENTS

| Chapter No. | Page No. | Name of the Chapter |
|-------------|----------|--|
| 1 | | Saving Lives and Livelihoods amidst a Once-in-a-Century Crisis |
| | 3 | COVID-19: Once in A Century 'Crisis' |
| | 6 | Research-Driven Policy Response amidst Unprecedented Uncertainty |
| | 15 | India's Humane Policy Response: Short-Term Pain, Long-Term Gain |
| | 17 | Efficacy of Initial Lockdown in Controlling the Pandemic |
| | 26 | India: Riding Against the Wave |
| | 29 | V-Shaped Economic Recovery Due to Timely Stringent Lockdown |
| | 32 | Far-Sighted Policy Response for Economic Recovery |
| | 40 | Looking Forward |
| 2 | | Does Growth lead to Debt Sustainability? Yes, But Not Vice- Versa! |
| | 48 | The (R-G) Differential and Debt Sustainability in India |
| | 52 | The IRGD and Debt Sustainability for Other Economies |
| | 56 | In India, Growth Leads to Debt Sustainability, Not Vice-Versa |
| | 60 | Direction of Causality in Other Economies |
| | 64 | Crowding Out Due to Public Expenditure? |
| | 69 | Structure of India's Debt |
| | 71 | Scenario Analysis: Is India's Current Debt Sustainable? |
| | 75 | Policy Implications |
| 3 | | Does India's Sovereign Credit Rating Reflect Its Fundamentals? No! |
| | 85 | The Bias Against Emerging Giants in Sovereign Credit Ratings |
| | 86 | India's Sovereign Credit Ratings |
| | 90 | Does India's Sovereign Credit Rating Reflect its Fundamentals? No! |
| | 96 | Have India's Sovereign Credit Ratings Reflected its Fundamentals in the Past? No! |
| | 99 | Does India's Sovereign Credit Rating Reflect its Willingness and Ability to Pay? No! |
| | 102 | Effect of Sovereign Credit Rating Changes on Select Indicators |
| | 110 | Macroeconomic Indicators as Determinants of Sovereign Credit Rating Changes |
| | 115 | Policy Implications |
| 4 | | Inequality and Growth: Conflict or Convergence? |
| | 122 | Introduction |
| | 123 | Growth, Inequality, and Socio-Economic Outcomes: India Versus The Advanced Economies |
| | 137 | Is Perfect Equality Optimal? |
| | 138 | Inequality or Poverty? |
| | 139 | Relative Impact of Economic Growth and Inequality on Poverty in India |
| | 143 | Summary and Conclusions |

| 5 | | Healthcare takes Centre Stage, Finally! |
|---|-----|--|
| | 151 | Introduction |
| | 152 | Given significant Market Failures, Healthcare needs careful System Design |
| | 154 | COVID-19 and India's Healthcare Policy |
| | 156 | Indian Healthcare Currently |
| | 162 | Unregulated Private Enterprise in an Industry marked by High Level of Market Failure |
| | 169 | Information Asymmetry in India's Private Insurance Markets |
| | 171 | Telemedicine |
| | 172 | Conclusion and Policy Suggestions |
| 6 | | Process Reforms |
| | 180 | The Problem of Regulatory Effectiveness |
| | 184 | The Inevitability of Incomplete Regulations |
| | 187 | The Problem of Regulatory Default |
| | 191 | Solving for Discretion |
| | 195 | Direction of Administrative Process Reforms |
| 7 | | Regulatory Forbearance an emergency medicine, not staple diet! |
| | 200 | Introduction |
| | 202 | The Original Sin: The Seven-Year Forbearance! |
| | 208 | Cost of Extended Forbearance Versus Early Resolution of Banking Crises: International Evidence |
| | 211 | Adverse Impact of Forbearance on Bank Performance and Lending |
| | 223 | Bank Clean-Up Without Adequate Capitalization |
| | 234 | Implications for the Current Forbearance Regime |
| 8 | | Innovation: Trending Up but Needs Thrust, Especially from the Private Sector |
| | 238 | Why Innovation Matters |
| | 240 | How Does India Perform on Innovation? |
| | 252 | India's Innovation Performance vis-à-vis Top Ten Economies |
| | 260 | Trends in India's Innovation Performance |
| | 266 | R&D Expenditure in India |
| | 269 | India's Performance on Patents and Trademarks |
| | 272 | Is Indian Innovation Affected by Access to Finance? |
| | 276 | Is India Effectively Translating Innovation Inputs into Innovation Outputs? |
| | 281 | Policy Implications |
| 9 | | JAY Ho: Ayushman Bharat's Jan Arogya Yojana (JAY) and Health Outcomes |
| | 287 | Introduction |
| | 289 | PM-JAY: Status and Progress so far |
| | 291 | Public Goods, Democracies and Governance |

| | 293 295 310 | PM-JAY and COVID-19 PM-JAY and Health Outcomes: Difference-In-Difference Estimates Concluding observations |
|----|-------------------|--|
| 10 | | The Bare Necessities |
| | 314 | Introduction |
| | 320 | Overall BNI |
| | 324 | Drinking Water Accessibility Index |
| | 325 | Sanitation Index |
| | 327 | Housing Index |
| | 328 | Micro-Environment Index |
| | 330 | Other Facilities Index |
| | 331 | Health Outcomes |
| | 332 | Education Outcomes |
| | 333 | Conclusion |

Acknowledgment

The Economic Survey 2020-21 is a result of teamwork and collaboration. The Survey has benefited from the comments and insights of the Hon'ble Finance Minister Smt. Nirmala Sitharaman and Hon'ble Minister of State for Finance Shri. Anurag Singh Thakur. The Survey has also benefited from the comments and inputs of various officials, specifically Tarun Bajaj, T. V. Somanathan, Rajiv Kumar, Shekhar C. Mande, Renu Swarup, Ashutosh Sharma, Prof. K. Vijay Raghavan, Guruprasad Mohapatra, Ajay Prakash Sawhney, A.K. Sharma and Indu Bhushan.

Contributions to the Survey from the Economic Division include: Sanjeev Sanyal, Rajiv Mishra, A Srija, Chandni Raina, Surbhi Jain, Abhishek Acharya, Jitender Singh, Abinash Dash, T. Gopinath, Kapil Patidar, Rajani Ranjan, Prerna Joshi, Dharmendra Kumar, Aakanksha Arora, M. Rahul, Harish Kumar Kallega, Tulsipriya Rajkumari, Gurvinder Kaur, Neha Singh, Sanjana Kadyan, Amit Sheoran, Shreya Bajaj, Manoj Kumar Mishra, Deeksha Supyaal Bisht, Subhash Chand, Riyaz Ahmad Khan, Md. Aftab Alam, Pradyut Kumar Pyne, Narendra Jena, Mritunjay Kumar, Rajesh Sharma, Amit Kumar Kesarwani, Shobeendra Akkayi, Mahima, Naveen Bali, Lavisha Arora, Sonali Chowdhry,.

The Survey benefited from the comments and inputs from officials, specifically Manish Kumar Jha, Deputy Secretary, DEA, Bikram Nath, Deputy Director, DEA, Ishita Das, Deputy Director, Survey Design & Research Division, MoSPI, Parveen Arora, Advisor, Department of Science and Technology (DST), Anita Gupta, Adviser, DST, A.N. Rai, Scientist, DST, Adil Zainulbhai, Chairman, Quality Council of India (QCI), Chetak Seethapathi, Project Manager, QCI, Aishwarya Grover, Project Associate, QCI.

We are also grateful for comments and inputs from numerous academics and practitioners, including Arvind Panagariya, Sajjid Chenoy, Gautam Chhaochharia, Gautam Chikermane, K. Vaidyanathan, Shiv Dixit, Prasanna Tantri, Shashwat Alok, Yakshup Chopra, Naman Nishesh, Nithin Mannil, Kirti Jain, Vaishali, Sriram Venkataraman, Sandhya Venkateshwaran, Sabyasachi Kar, Rajesh Raj S.N., Kunal Sen, Sunil Tirumalai, Dipojjal Saha, Avinash Kumar Pandey, Anup Karan, Maulik Chokshi, Amrita Agarwal, Rana Mehta, Ashwani Aggarwal, Henna Dhawan, Vipul Aggarwal, Ram Singh. Hemanth Bharatha Chakravarthy

Apart from the above, various Ministries, Departments and Organisations of the Government of India made contributions in their respective sectors. Several ministries directly interacted with me via presentations to provide their inputs. The Economic Survey is gratified for their valuable time, engagement and contributions. Able administrative support was given by K. Rajaraman, Meera Swarup, Ravinder Kumar, Jasbir Singh, Amit Kumar, Sanjay Kumar Pandita; Sunil Dutt, Rohit; Sushil Sharma, Manish Panwar, Meenakshi Gupta, Suresh Kumar Arora, Muna Sah, Jodh Singh, Ajbir Singh; S.Ramakrishnan, Satyendra Kishore, Kuldeep Mehra in Office of CEA and other staff members of the Economic Division. The cover page for the Survey was designed by India Brand Equity Foundation. Izzur Rahman, N.P Sharma, Deepak Kumar and Gautam Halder from Elegant Publishing (P) Ltd. did page setting of the English and Hindi version of the Survey.

Finally, the Economic Survey owes deep gratitude to the families of all those involved in its preparation for being ever so patient, understanding and encouraging and for extending their unflinching emotional and physical support and encouragement throughout the preparation. The families, indeed, are the unconditional pillars of support for the dedicated contributors to the Economic Survey.

Krishnamurthy V. Subramanian
Chief Economic Adviser
Ministry of Finance
Government of India

Preface

ॐ असतो मा सद्गमय । तमसो मा ज्योतर्गिमय । O Lord, Keep me not in Unreality, but make me go towards the Reality, Keep me not in Darkness, but make me go towards the Light.

Economic Survey 2020-21 is an ardent tribute to the immortal human spirit of grit and compassion encapsulated by the tireless battle against the pandemic by our frontline COVID-19 warriors. In the midst of the most unfathomable global health emergency experienced in modern history, the resolve of each Indian helped find its way from the darkness of 'lives vs livelihoods' to the glow of '#SavingLives&Livelihoods'. The foresight of our collective vision to battle this pandemic became evident when policy insights and implementation at the Centre, State and local level converged to initiate a V-shaped economic recovery. This spirit resonated in the recent Team India's victory in Australia where their resilience to rebound from 36 all out to winning the Test series was a V-shaped performance indeed! Similarly, after experiencing a sharp contraction of 23.9% in first quarter of 2020-21, India is expected to be the fastest growing economy in the next two years. Projections by various national and international agencies including the IMF project this resilience of the Indian economy.

Through this year, as India bravely fought the global pandemic, it charted its own unique trajectory – showing remarkable resilience, be it fighting the virus or ensuring economic recovery. This resilience is driven by the strength of our systems that enforced the graded public health measures, ramped up the health response, ensured free food grains to 80 crore people and gave momentum to the economic recovery. India derived its strength from the support of 137 crore Indians who practised social distancing, wore masks and industriously contributed to the fight.

Team@Eco Survey, 2020-21 recognises the integral role of effective policymaking in charting the path to economic growth and social development. The upturn in the economy while avoiding a second wave of infections makes India a sui generis case in strategic policymaking, of being fearless to choose the road less travelled by; for in the end, that makes all the difference. India's human-centric policy response to the pandemic, tailored to India's unique vulnerabilities, demonstrated the power of upholding self-belief under immense uncertainty. India transformed the short-term trade-off between lives and livelihoods into a win-win in the medium to long-term that saves both lives and livelihoods. Empowered by vision and foresight, India turned this crisis into an opportunity by ramping up its health and testing infrastructure and implementing a slew of seminal reforms to strengthen the long-term growth potential of the economy.

Clarity of objectives is imperative in policymaking as the various macro-economic policy choices always present inherent trade-offs. The Survey makes the case for continued focus on economic growth as the most important objective for India at its stage of development. Survey, then, delineates the constituents that would strengthen effectiveness of policymaking — continued reforms, innovation, timely regulatory support and withdrawal of forbearance. Continuing the endeavours of previous Surveys to relate economics to a common person, this year the Survey constructs an index of 'the bare necessities' across States in India.

Digital Technology has been the 'sprint runner' of this year that enabled us to tide over the disruptive effects of the pandemic. As a recognition of its role, the Survey this year has gone digital. To enhance the e-readability, for the first time, the aligning of the text in the Survey is in a single column. We chose to continue with the popular tradition of presenting the Survey in two volumes. Volume I, attempts to provide evidence based economic analyses of the challenges of policymaking and tools to make it more effective. Volume II reviews recent developments in the major sectors of the economy with a focus on the challenges faced due to the pandemic this year. This would serve as the ready reckoner for the existing status and outlook for the sectors.

The Economic Survey attributes its existence and popularity to the collaborative effort of all Ministries and Departments of Government of India, the prodigious resource base of the Indian Economic Service officers, valuable inputs of researchers, consultants and think tanks both within and outside the government and the consistent support of all officials of the Economic Division, Department of Economic Affairs. The Survey has made a sincere effort to live up to the expectation of being an indispensable guide on performance, challenges and prospects of the Indian economy.

As our former President Dr A.P.J.Abdul Kalam said "When we tackle obstacles, we find hidden reserves of courage and resilience we did not know we had.....We only need to find them and move on with our lives". This year is a testimony to the resilience and intrinsic strength of the fundamentals of the Indian society and the economy. We present this year's Survey with a deep sense of confidence that Indians have demonstrated to come out victorious against any adversity. The Survey salutes this self-belief of 137 crore Indians.

Krishnamurthy V. Subramanian Chief Economic Adviser Ministry of Finance Government of India

ABBREVIATIONS

AB PMJAY Ayushman Bharat Pradhan Mantri Jan Arogya Yojana

ACSQHC Australian Commission on Safety and Quality in Health Care

AE Advanced Economies
AGM Annual General Meeting

AIDIS All India Debt and Investment Survey

ALM Asset-liability management
ALP Advanced Leadership Program

AM Ayushman Mitra ANB Atma Nirbhar Bharat

ANZSOG Australia and New Zealand School of Government

APAR Annual Performance Appraisal Report
APMC Agricultural Produce Market Committee

APS Australian Public Service AQR Asset Quality Review

ARC Administrative Reforms Commission
ASEAN Association of Southeast Asian Nations

AUS Australia AUT Austria

BDO Block Development Officer

BEL Belgium

BIS Beneficiary Identification System

BNI Bare Necessities Index BPL Below Poverty Line

BPO Business Process Outsourcing

BRICS Brazil, Russia, India, China, and South Africa

BSE BSE Limited

CAGR Compound Annual Growth Rate

CAN Canada

CAR Capital Adequacy Ratio
CCS Covenanted Civil Service
CCS Central Civil Service
CEO Chief Executive Officer
CFR Case Fatality Rate

CHE Switzerland

CMS Centres for Medicare & Medicaid Services

COVID-19 Coronavirus Disease
CPI Consumer Price Inflation

CPRS Central Policy Review Staff (UK)

CRA Credit Rating Agency
CSC Civil Service Commission
CSC Common Service Centres
CSR Corporate Social Responsibility
CVC Central Vigilance Commission
CXP Current External Payments

CXR Current Account External Receipts

DA Dearness Allowance

DARPG Department of Administrative Reforms and Public Grievances

DEU Germany

DHHS Department of Health and Human Services

DiD Difference-in-Difference
DISCOM Distribution Company
DM Deputy Minister
DNK Denmark

DOPT Department of Personnel and Training
DOTS Directly Observed Therapy, Short course

EME Emerging Market Economies
EoDB Ease of Doing Business

ESP Spain

ETC Electronic Toll Collection

FC Foreign Currency

FDI Foreign Direct Investment

FE Fixed Effects
FIN Finland

FMI Financial Management Initiative FPI Foreign Portfolio Investment

FRA France

FSB Financial Stability Board FTE Full Time Equivalent

G-20 Group 20

GAO General Accountability Office

GBR United Kingdom

GCF Gross Capital Formation
GDP Gross Domestic Product

GEI Government Effectiveness Index GeM Government e Marketplace

GERD Gross Domestic Expenditure on Research & Development

GFC Global Financial Crisis
GII Global Innovation Index
GNPA Gross Non-Performing Assets

GRC Greece

GSDP Gross State Domestic Product

G-Sec Government Securities
GVA Gross Value Added
HCR Human Capital & Research

HDE Human Development Expenditure

HoD Head of Department HR Human Resources

HRM Human Resource Management
IAS Indian Administrative Service

IBBI Insolvency and Bankruptcy Board of India

IBC Insolvency and Bankruptcy Code

ICS Indian Civil Service

ICT Information & Communication Technology iGOT Integrated Government Online Training

IIP Index of Industrial Production
IMF International Monetary Fund

IMR Infant Mortality Rate

INR Indian Rupee

IPCR Individual Performance, Commitment and Review

IPO Initial Public Offering

IRDA Insurance Regulatory and Development Authority

IRGD Interest rate- growth differential

IRL Ireland ISR Israel

IT Information Technology

ITA Italy

ITAT Income Tax Appellate Tribunals

JPN Japan

JV Joint Venture

KTO Knowledge & Technology Outputs

L1 Least Cost Criteria

LMIC Low and Lower Middle Income MCA Ministry of Corporate Affairs MDG Millennium Development Goal

MGNREGS Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme

MINIS Management Information System for Ministers

MLP Medium to Long Term Plan MMR Maternal Mortality Rate MNC Multinational Corporation

MoHFW Ministry of Health and Family Welfare

MoM Month on Month

MoSPI Ministry of Statistics and Program Implementation

MPM Ministry of Personnel Management
MSBY Mukhyamantri Swasthya Bima Yojana
MSME Micro, Small and Medium Enterprises

NABH National Accreditation Board for Hospitals & Healthcare Providers

NBER National Bureau of Economic Research

NCD Non Communicable Disease NCD Non Convertible Debentures

NCLAT National Company Law Appellate Tribunal

NCLT National Company Law Tribunal
NFHS National Family Health Survey
NHA National Health Authority
NHCP National Health Care Providers

NHM National Health Mission NHS National Health Service

NII High Net-Worth Individual Investor NIP National Investment Pipeline

NIPFP National Institute of Public Finance and Policy

NLD Netherlands

NMR Neonatal mortality rate

NOR Norway

NPAs Non-Performing Assets

NPI Non Pharmaceutical Interventions

NPM New Public Management

NSDL National Securities Depository Limited

NSDP Net State Domestic Product

NSE National Stock Exchange of India Limited

NSO National Statistical Office

NSQHS National Safety and Quality Health Service

NSS National Sample Survey

NSSO National Sample Survey Office

New Zealand **NZL**

ODF Open Defecation Free

OECD Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development

OLS Ordinary Least Square

OOP Out of Pocket

Out of Pocket Expenses OOPE OPD Outpatient Department

OPM Office of Personnel Management

OSP Other Service Providers

OxCGRT Oxford COVID PF Provident Fund **PHACO** Phacoemulsification

PLI Production Linked Incentive **PMAY** Pradhan Mantri Awas Yojana

PMGKY Pradhan Mantri Garib Kalyan Yojana **PMJAY** Pradhan Mantri Jan Arogya Yojana **PMJDY** Pradhan Mantri Jan Dhan Yojana

PMO Prime Minister's Office

PPE Personal Protective Equipment PPP Purchasing Power Parity

PRP/P4P Performance Related Pay/Pay for Performance

PRT Portugal

PSB Public Sector Bank

PSC Public Service Commission OIB Qualified Institutional Buyer OOF Quality & Outcome Framework R&D Research and Development RBI Reserve Bank of India

REP Ricardian Equivalence Proposition **RFD** Results Framework Document

RHS Right Hand Side

RII Retail Individual Investor **RPTs** Related party transactions

RQ Regulatory Quality

RSBY Rashtriya Swasthya Bima Yojana

S&P Standard & Poor S&T Science & Technology SAG Senior Administrative Grade SBM Swachh Bharat Mission Senior Civil Servant SCS

SDG Sustainable Development Goals

SEA South-East Asia(n) SECC Socio Economic Caste Census SEQI School education Quality Index

SES Senior Executive Service

SGP Singapore

SHI Statutory Health Insurance
SICS Small incision cataract surgery
SLWM Solid & Liquid Waste Management

SPARROW Smart Performance Appraisal Report Recording Online Window

SPMS Strategic Performance Management System

SRM Sovereign Analytical Pillars SSC Staff Selection Commission

SWE Sweden
TB Tuberculosis

U5MR Under-Five Mortality Rate

UK United Kingdom
UN United Nations

UNICEF United Nations Children's Fund UPSC Union Public Service Commission

US United States of America

USA United States
UT Union Territory

WGI Worldwide Governance Indicators WHO World Health Organization

WIPO World Intellectual Property Organisation

YoY Year on Year